

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 1 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

POLICY

This policy establishes procedures covering informal counseling and corrective action, including warnings, as well as formal discipline, comprising probation, suspension, and dismissal, of house staffs. This policy also explains under what circumstances a program may decide not to renew a house staff's appointment.

In addition, this policy sets forth the means by which house staffs may seek redress for or appeal discipline or dismissal; nonrenewal of appointment; any alleged inappropriate treatment; non-promotion and non-graduation; or other issues. This policy supersedes former GME Policy # GE 16 Corrective Action for House Staff., and provides the exclusive opportunity for formal redress of complaints.


In promulgating this policy, it is the intent of the Graduate Medical Education Committee (GMEC) to ensure continued compliance with Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education (ACGME) requirements concerning established "policies on and procedures for grievance and due process" (Institutional Requirements, III.D.f) as well as clarify house staffs' rights regarding redress and due process, as set forth below.

SCOPE

This policy applies to house staff participating in Pennsylvania Hospital of the University of Pennsylvania Health System (PAH) ACGME accredited training programs.

This policy provides the exclusive remedy for house staff appealing formal discipline or nonrenewal of appointment.

Pursuant to this policy house staff may also raise any concern regarding treatment perceived to be inappropriate, unfair, or illegal. Such treatment may include, but is not limited to, duty assignments, scheduling, application of GME policies, non-promotion and non-graduation, and discrimination or harassment, *except that* complaints of discrimination or harassment on the basis of race, sex, national origin, ethnicity, religion, gender, sexual orientation or gender identity, marital or parental status, age, disability, and veteran status) may be brought and shall be handled in accordance with GME Policy #II-G Prohibited Harassment of House Staff including Sexual, Racial and Gender Discrimination and other established PAH policies and practices. With the exception of such discrimination and harassment, this policy provides the exclusive formal remedy for concerns regarding inappropriate or unfair treatment; perceived inequitable application of rules, policies, or practices; or issues previously handled under former GME Policy #III-AA Corrective Action, Discipline and Dispute Procedures for House Staff.

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 2 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

This policy also provides the exclusive internal remedy for house staff reporting alleged violations of GME Policy #II-B Appropriate Treatment of House Staff.

This policy does not and is not intended to constitute an employment contract or alter any house staff's agreement, nor is it itself intended to create for house staffs any legally enforceable contractual right.

IMPLEMENTATION AND ADMINISTRATION

The Designated Institution Official (DIO), Chair of GMEC, GMEC, Office of Graduate Medical Education (GME), clinical department chairs, and program directors are responsible for implementing and applying this policy.

The administrator of this policy shall be the GMEC, in that it alone has the discretionary authority to construe the policy's terms, to reconcile any inconsistency, to resolve disputed issues of fact, and to make determinations and reach conclusions relating to the policy. The GMEC also has the authority to delegate its powers enumerated herein, and, to the extent not inconsistent with this policy, and not specifically disallowed or overruled by the GMEC, the GMEC chair may exercise such powers.

House staffs are responsible for complying with the procedures set forth herein when seeking redress. Consistent with the procedure set forth in GME Policy #II-J Ombudsperson for House Staff, it is the responsibility of house staff to seek such redress.

DEFINITIONS

As used herein, informal counseling and corrective action include feedback, constructive criticism, and oral and written warnings. Such communication is distinct from formal discipline, defined below.


Formal discipline comprises probation, suspension, and dismissal.

Appointment nonrenewal means nonrenewal of a house staff's agreement, resulting in its expiration at the end of the current term and termination of employment. Nonrenewal should not be considered disciplinary, and should not be characterized as such in the event a reference or training verification is requested.

PROCEDURES

I. Informal Counseling and Corrective Action

If a department chair or program director or the GMEC chair deems a house staff's performance or conduct to be deficient, and the ordinary elements of the educational program or evaluations appear unavailing, the program director (or his or her designee) should informally counsel or administer

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 3 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

corrective action to the house staff. Such communication may come in the form of an oral or written warning that failure to improve will result in formal discipline under this policy.

The first indication or instance of deficient performance or conduct or a violation of policy ordinarily warrants a warning. If not severe, failure to meet moral, ethical, professional, or academic standards, or a failure to fulfill duties or responsibilities, also warrants a warning.

The warning should reference the conduct or concern giving rise to the warning and the program's expectations for improvement, and advise the house staff that a failure to improve will result in formal discipline under this policy. The department chair, program director, or GMEC chair may also prescribe increased supervision for a certain period, consistent with the program's expectations for improvement.

Informal counseling and corrective action, including oral and written warnings, are distinct from the categories of formal discipline set forth below, and accordingly should not be cited as disciplinary in the event a reference or training verification is requested.


II. Formal Discipline

Should a warning fail to resolve the issue, or in the case of a severe instance of misconduct or policy violation, a program may administer formal discipline, as set forth below.

A. Grounds for Issuing Formal Discipline

In accordance with this policy, the GMEC chair or a department chair or program director may discipline house staff under the following circumstances:

- failure to meet patient care standards;
- failure to meet pertinent moral, ethical, or academic standards or standards relating to professionalism;
- failure to fulfill duties or responsibilities as determined by the program (including but not limited to record completion) or as outlined in the house staff agreement;
- failure to uphold obligations in the house staff agreement or breach of the agreement;
- failure to obtain or maintain required licensure, or failure to sit for and pass required examinations, by any applicable deadline;

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 4 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

- violations of PAH, UPHS, and/or University of Pennsylvania policies, procedures, or practices, or violations of other entities' applicable policies;
- use or possession of alcohol (except in accordance with a PAH-sponsored event) and/or illegal drugs while on PAH or UPHS property or during working hours or program participation;
- failure to abide by the terms of a return-to-work agreement covered by PAH's impaired house staff policy, failure to submit to a toxicology screen requested in accordance with policy, or other violation of PAH's impaired house staff policy;
- personal conduct (including but not limited to commission of a crime) interfering with or precluding proper fulfillment of duties;
- workplace violence;
- insubordination; or
- willful misconduct.

B. Procedure for Issuing Formal Discipline

Only the GMEC chair, a department chair, or a program director may issue formal discipline under this policy. In addition, a program ordinarily should only formally discipline a house staff after the failure of informal counseling and/or corrective action, or in cases of severe misconduct, policy violation, or neglect of duty, or in cases perceived to present an immediate threat to safety.


If in opinion of the GMEC chair and either the department chair or program director a house staff's deficient performance or conduct is attributable to an impairment or impairments covered by PAH's impaired house staff policy, the GMEC chair and the department chair or program director may opt not to discipline formally, or may opt to reduce the severity of discipline (e.g. from dismissal to probation) on the condition that the house staff agree to be evaluated and, if appropriate, seek treatment for such impairment(s).

C. Types of Formal Discipline

1. Probation

Probation generally comprises a period of heightened monitoring of a house staff's performance, as well as the stated intent to re-evaluate his or her performance during and/or after such period.

a. Grounds for Probation

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 5 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

Probation may be appropriate in cases of continued or inexcusably poor performance or repeated or severe violation(s) of policy; where there has been a failure to respond to a warning; as well as in any situation requiring continuous, close monitoring of house staff performance, including any PGY year repeated or return to work under an impaired professional policy.

b. Administration of Probation

At the time the house staff is placed on probation, the house staff should be notified in writing of at least the following:


- the reason(s) for the decision to place the house staff on probation;
- the date probation began or will begin;
- the program’s expectations for improvement, including specific reference to areas in which performance must improve;
- the consequences of failure to improve (which ordinarily shall be dismissal);
- the date by which the house staff will be re-evaluated or his or her status reconsidered or when probation will end if performance has sufficiently improved; and
- his or her right to appeal discipline in accordance with GME policy. Specifically, notification should include a statement substantially similar to the following: *“Within 30 days of today’s date, you may appeal your probation by addressing a written statement to the chair of the Graduate Medical Education Committee in accordance with GME policy on discipline and dispute resolution.”*

A copy of the written notification must be provided to the GMEC chair, and it ordinarily shall be included in the house staff’s file.

2. Suspension and Dismissal

a. Grounds for Suspension and/or Dismissal

Under the circumstances described in the paragraphs below, dismissing a house staff from a program is justified. The GMEC chair and the department chair or program director, however, may consider suspension as an alternative when the house staff’s nonperformance, deficient performance, or misconduct can be corrected or undone. In such case the suspension may be for a length of time required for the correction or in accordance with the gravity of the offense. In addition, the GMEC chair and department chair or program director may suspend a house staff and condition his or her

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 6 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

return upon completion of specific education requirements or community service. Suspension also is appropriate when an allegation of misconduct, or other matter of serious concern, warranting dismissal must be investigated or resolved.

Dismissal is justified if a house staff does not obtain or maintain without restriction any required license or fails to sit for and pass examinations required for licensure by the applicable deadline(s).

Dismissal may also be warranted for severe or repeated policy violations or any significant incident or repeated incidents of insubordination, dishonesty, willful misconduct, or workplace violence, or personal conduct precluding proper fulfillment of duties. Certain violations of PAH impaired house staff policy (including but not limited to use or possession of illegal drugs on PAH property or during employment or program participation), refusal to submit to a toxicology screen requested in accordance with the policy, or violation of a return-to-work agreement) ordinarily warrant dismissal. Irremediably poor performance and/or poor performance during or following a probationary period or following a suspension, failure to comply with probation terms, or failure to comply with expectations for improvement following a suspension also ordinarily warrants dismissal.

Dismissal is appropriate if a house staff materially breaches his or her house staff agreement or if any material certification or representation from the house staff in the agreement is invalid or untrue.

Conduct presenting an immediate threat to patient, staff, or guest safety, or a significant threat to the facility, may also warrant immediate suspension or dismissal.


b. Administration of Suspension and Dismissal

A department chair or program director may not suspend or dismiss house staff without conferring first with the GMEC chair, except insofar as safety or program welfare may require immediate action, in which case the department chair or program director should consult with the GMEC chair promptly thereafter.

1. Suspension

Suspension may be with or without pay, at the discretion of the department chair. Suspension with or without pay also may be characterized and recorded as administrative leave, if appropriate, in cases in which suspension relates to an investigation. Otherwise when suspending a house staff the GMEC chair, department chair, or program director ordinarily should notify the house staff *in writing* of at least the following:

- the reason(s) for the decision to suspend;

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 7 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

- the effective date of the suspension and its end date, if not indefinite due to the need to investigate or for another reason;
- the program’s expectations for improvement;
- any specific duty or requirement the house staff must fulfill in order to return to the program;
- the consequences of failure to improve or comply with any requirement; and
- his or her right to appeal discipline in accordance with GME policy. Specifically, notification should include a statement substantially similar to the following: *“Within 30 days of today’s date, you may appeal your suspension by addressing a written statement to the chair of the Graduate Medical Education Committee in accordance with GME policy on discipline and dispute resolution.”*

A copy of the written notification must be provided to the GMEC chair, and it ordinarily shall be included in the house staff’s file.

2. Dismissal


The chair or program director should notify the house staff in writing of the effective date of dismissal. *The written notification to the house staff should also include a statement substantially similar to the following: “Within 30 days of today’s date, you may appeal your dismissal by addressing a written statement to the chair of the Graduate Medical Education Committee in accordance with GME policy on discipline and dispute resolution.”* A copy of this notification must be provided to the GMEC chair, and it ordinarily shall be included in the house staff’s file.

C. Opportunity for Redress

Step 1: Submission of Request

If a house staff believes any formal discipline administered to him or her is excessive, unwarranted, unfair, or otherwise objectionable, he or she must ask the GMEC chair *in writing* to review the matter. The following is required of the house staff in order that his or her request might be reviewed:

- the written request should be submitted in confidence to the Office of GME, addressed to the GMEC chair;
- the office must *receive* the request within 30 days of the date the house staff became aware of the discipline; and
- the request must contain or be accompanied by a written account setting forth in detail the house staff’s version of any incident(s) preceding the discipline, as well as any and all reasons

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 8 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

the house staff believes the discipline to be excessive, unwarranted, unfair, or otherwise objectionable.

Step 2: GMEC Chair Review

Upon receipt of a written request and the house staff's account, the GMEC chair shall review the request for a period of no more than 30 days. The GMEC chair may dismiss the request if it fails to meet the requirements set forth in Step 1. During the 30-day period, the GMEC chair may also review the request with the department chair, the program director, and/or the house staff, in an attempt to facilitate resolution.

The GMEC chair may appoint another member of the GMEC to perform the foregoing tasks in any case in which the GMEC chair's impartiality might reasonably be questioned.

Step 3: Final Review by GMEC


If the matter is not resolved, the GMEC chair shall present the request to the GMEC for further review. The GMEC meeting should take place within 60 days of the house staff's submitting the request, except if extraordinary circumstances require additional time. At such meeting the GMEC chair shall preside and charge the GMEC with reviewing the house staff's request and account as well as any statements the department chair and/or program director may wish to submit. The GMEC or a designated subcommittee or member may also interview any witness or interested party, at or in advance of the GMEC's meeting. At the meeting any GMEC member affiliated with the house staff's department shall recuse himself or herself from voting. A majority vote of GMEC members present and voting shall be required to reverse or modify discipline. The GMEC may meet on multiple occasions, but its vote shall occur only once, and absentee ballots shall not be considered. All decisions from the GMEC shall be final, and shall be communicated in writing to the house staff.

Failure to submit a timely written request, as well as failure to provide a written account as described above, or appear at the request of the GMEC, its chair, or its designee, shall be deemed abandonment of the opportunity for redress under this policy.

During any review of a house staff's request, all discipline against the house staff shall be stayed, although the house staff may be placed on paid or unpaid administrative leave if in the opinion of the GMEC chair such leave is necessary for safety or program welfare.

If any of the deadlines set forth above falls on a weekend or holiday, the deadline shall be the next business day.

The procedure outlined above shall be the house staff's exclusive remedy within PAH. At the time or at any time after the house staff submits his or her request, he or she may ask the GMEC chair to

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 9 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

appoint a School of Medicine faculty member as the house staff's advisor. A house staff shall not have the right to be advised by any faculty member he or she chooses, unless such faculty member and the GMEC chair consent to the choice; nor shall a house staff have the right at any time to appear before the chair or GMEC accompanied by an attorney.

Consistent with the principles underpinning GME Policy #II-J Ombudsperson for House Staff, no house staff shall be subject to discipline or corrective action, or otherwise discriminated against with respect to the terms or conditions of employment, for action taken or statements made in good faith under the procedure outlined above. The making of knowingly false or reckless accusations or statements under this policy violates acceptable norms of behavior for PAH house staff.

III. Agreement Nonrenewal


Agreement nonrenewal results in the house staff's termination from the program upon expiration of the current agreement's term.

A. Notification and Grounds for Nonrenewal

In lieu of administering formal discipline, a program may opt not to renew a house staff's agreement where there has been continued or inexcusably poor performance or repeated or severe violation(s) of policy *and* the house staff has failed to improve performance in response to a warning. The GMEC chair or a department chair or program director may also opt not to renew a house staff's agreement whenever a house staff has failed to complete or cannot complete any action required to maintain licensure, or otherwise becomes ineligible for further participation and/or employment. *A department chair or program director must confer with the GMEC chair about any decision not to renew.*

A program must provide written notice of its decision not to renew at least four months before the house staff's current agreement expires. If the basis for nonrenewal arises within this four-month period, however, the program should provide notice as soon as practicable. Notification of nonrenewal should include a statement, advising the house staff of his or her opportunity for redress, in a form substantially similar to the following: *"Within 30 days of today's date, you may appeal this decision by addressing a written statement to the chair of the Graduate Medical Education Committee in accordance with GME policy on agreement nonrenewal."*

Nonrenewal may also occur due to a decision to reduce the size of or close a residency program. In the event PAH decides to reduce the size of or close an ACGME accredited program, any house staff affected by such decision must be advised as soon as practicable that his or her agreement will not be renewed. Under such circumstances, PAH GME will allow such residents either to complete their training or will assist such residents to enroll in an ACGME-accredited program in which they can continue their education.

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 10 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

Note that in all circumstances, nonrenewal should not be considered disciplinary, and should not be characterized as such in the event a reference or training verification is requested.

B. Opportunity for Redress

A house staff may appeal a decision not to renew by submitting in confidence a written request and account to the Office of Graduate Medical Education, addressed to the chair. The chair must receive such request within 30 days of the date the house staff is notified of the decision not to renew. The request will be reviewed in accordance with the three-step procedure outlined above in subsection I.C. This procedure shall be the house staff's exclusive remedy within PAH; specifically, the house staff may not invoke the UPMC employee grievance procedure.

Failure to submit a timely written request, as well as failure to provide a written account as described above, or appear at the request of the GMEC, its chair, or its designee, shall be deemed abandonment of the opportunity for redress under this policy.

If GMEC review of a house staff's request runs beyond the expiration of the house staff's current agreement, the house staff ordinarily will at that time be placed on unpaid administrative leave.


At the time or at any time after the house staff submits his or her request, he or she may ask the GMEC chair to appoint a School of Medicine faculty member as the house staff's advisor. A house staff shall not have the right to be advised by any faculty member he or she chooses, unless such faculty member and the GMEC chair consent to the choice; nor shall a house staff have the right at any time to appear before the GMEC chair or GMEC accompanied by an attorney.

Consistent with the principles underpinning GME policy #II-J Ombudsperson for House Staff, no house staff shall be subject to discipline or corrective action, or otherwise discriminated against with respect to the terms or conditions of employment, for action taken or statements made in good faith under the procedure outlined above. The making of knowingly false or reckless accusations or statements under this policy violates acceptable norms of behavior for PAH house staff.

IV. Dispute Resolution/Redress for Inappropriate Treatment

Minor issues may be resolved informally, often during everyday discussion between the house staff and the program director. House staff who seeks GMEC intervention, however, must file a complaint and follow the formal process outlines below. This includes allegations of inappropriate treatment in violation of GME Policy #II-B Appropriate Treatment of House Staff, complaints regarding nonpromotion or nongraduation, or any complaint alleging discriminatory conduct or a violation of law, regulation, or policy.

Step 1: Submission of Request

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 11 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

A house staff filing a complaint must ask the GMEC chair *in writing* to review the matter. The following is required of the house staff in order that his or her request might be reviewed:

- the written request should be submitted in confidence to the Office of Graduate Medical Education, addressed to the GMEC chair; and
- the request must contain or be accompanied by a written account setting forth in detail the house staff's complaint as well as the facts relating to the incident or conduct in question.

The GMEC chair must *receive* the house staff's request within 30 days of the incident complained of or the occurrence of conduct constituting or resulting in an allegedly inappropriate work environment. Failure to submit a timely written request, as well as failure to provide a written account as described above, shall be deemed abandonment of the opportunity for redress under this policy.

Step 2: GMEC Chair Review


Upon receipt of a written request and the house staff's account, the GMEC chair shall review the request for a period of no more than 30 days. The GMEC chair may dismiss the request if it fails to meet the requirements set forth in Step 1. During the 30-day period, the GMEC chair may also review the request with any or all appropriate individuals in an attempt to facilitate resolution.

The GMEC chair may appoint another member of the GMEC to perform the foregoing tasks in any case in which the GMEC chair's impartiality might reasonably be questioned.

Step 3: Final Review by GMEC

If the matter is not resolved, the GMEC chair shall present the request to the GMEC for further review. The GMEC meeting should take place within 60 days of the house staff's submitting the request, except if extraordinary circumstances require additional time. At such meeting any GMEC member affiliated with the house staff's department shall recuse himself or herself from any vote taken. The GMEC chair shall preside and charge the GMEC with reviewing the house staff's request and account as well as any other statements forwarded by the GMEC chair. The GMEC or a designated subcommittee or member may also interview any witness or interested party, at or in advance of the GMEC's meeting. The GMEC may issue recommendations or a decision, which shall be final and communicated in writing to the house staff.

Failure to submit a timely written request, as well as failure to provide a written account as described above, or appear at the request of the GMEC, its chair, or its designee, shall be deemed abandonment of the opportunity for redress under this policy.


Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official

GME Policy #: II-I	Graduate Medical Education Policy & Procedures Pennsylvania Hospital	Page 12 of 12 Effective: 06/18/2008
	Subject: House Staff Discipline, Non-renewal and Dispute Resolution	

If any of the deadlines set forth above falls on a weekend or holiday, the deadline shall be the next business day.

The procedure outlined above shall be the house staff's exclusive remedy within PAH. At the time or at any time after the house staff submits his or her request, he or she may ask the GMEC chair to appoint a School of Medicine faculty member as the house staff's advisor. A house staff shall not have the right to be advised by any faculty member he or she chooses, unless such faculty member and the GMEC chair consent to the choice; nor shall a house staff have the right at any time to appear before the GMEC chair or GMEC accompanied by an attorney.

Consistent with the principles underpinning GME Policy #II-J Ombudsperson for House Staff, no house staff shall be subject to discipline or corrective action, or otherwise discriminated against with respect to the terms or conditions of employment, for action taken or statements made in good faith under the procedure outlined above. The making of knowingly false or reckless accusations or statements under this policy violates acceptable norms of behavior for PAH house staff.

Supersedes: New	
	Issued by: R. Michael Buckley, MD Designated Institutional Official